arXiv:1603.07006v1 [math.CO] 22 Mar 2016

New proofs of Melzak's identity

Ulrich Abel

Fachbereich MND
Technische Hochschule Mittelhessen
Wilhelm-Leuschner-Straße 13, 61169 Friedberg,
Germany
Ulrich.Abel@mnd.thm.de

Henry W. Gould

Department of Mathematics
West Virginia University
Morgantown, WV 26506
USA
henrygou@gmail.com

Jocelyn Quaintance

Department of Computer Science
University of Pennsylvania
Philadelphia, PA 19104
USA
quaintan@temple.edu

Abstract.

In their recent book [3] on combinatorial identities, Quaintance and Gould devoted one chapter [3, Chapt. 7] to Melzak's identity. We give new proofs for this identity and its generalization.

Mathematics Subject Classification (2010): 05A19.
Keywords: Combinatorial identity, Melzak's identity.

1 Introduction

Melzak's identity [2] (see also [3, Eq. (7.1)]) states that

$$f(x+y) = x\binom{x+n}{n}\sum_{k=0}^{n}(-1)^k\binom{n}{k}\frac{f(y-k)}{x+k} \qquad (x,y\in\mathbb{R},\ n=0,1,2,\ldots), \tag{1}$$

where $x \neq -k$ $(k=0,1,\ldots,n)$, for all algebraic polynomials f up to degree n. It has several interesting applications (see [3, Chapt. 7]).

In his recent book on combinatorial identities, J. Quaintance and H. W. Gould gave an elementary proof [3, p. 79–82] using partial fraction decomposition. Furthermore, they generalized Melzak's identity by replacing $x+k$ in the denominator $x+k$ of Eq. (1) with a product $(x_0+k)(x_1+k)\cdots(x_j+k)$ of finitely many pairwise different linear factors:

$$\sum_{k=0}^{n}(-1)^k\binom{n}{k}\frac{f(y-k)}{\prod_{i=0}^{j}(x_i+k)} = \sum_{i=0}^{j}\frac{1}{x_i\binom{x_i+n}{n}\prod_{\nu=0,\nu\neq i}^{j}(x_\nu-x_i)}f(y+x_i), \tag{2}$$

for $n=0,1,2,\ldots$ and $y\in\mathbb{R}$ (see [3, Eq. (7.52)]). Of course, we assume that $x_i \neq -k$ for $k=0,1,\ldots,n$ and $i=0,1,\ldots,j$.

2 An elementary proof of Melzak's identity

Because Melzak's identity (1) is linear it is sufficient to prove it for the functions $f_r(x)=x^r$ $(r=0,1,\ldots,n)$. Observing that

$$\frac{f_r(y-k)}{x+k} = \frac{((x+y)-(x+k))^r}{x+k} = \sum_{j=0}^{r}(-1)^j\binom{r}{j}(x+y)^{r-j}(x+k)^{j-1}$$

we obtain

$$\sum_{k=0}^{n}(-1)^k\binom{n}{k}\frac{f(y-k)}{x+k} = \sum_{j=0}^{r}(-1)^j\binom{r}{j}(x+y)^{r-j}\sum_{k=0}^{n}(-1)^k\binom{n}{k}(x+k)^{j-1}.$$

The second sum is a difference of order n which vanishes when applied to polynomials of degree $r-1\leq n-1$. Therefore, we have, for $x>0$,

$$\begin{aligned}
&\sum_{k=0}^{n}(-1)^k\binom{n}{k}\frac{f_r(y-k)}{x+k}\\
=\ &(x+y)^r\sum_{k=0}^{n}(-1)^k\binom{n}{k}(x+k)^{-1} = f_r(x+y)\sum_{k=0}^{n}(-1)^k\binom{n}{k}\int_0^1 t^{x+k-1}dt\\
=\ &f_r(x+y)\int_0^1 t^{x-1}(1-t)^n\,dt = f_r(x+y)\cdot B(x,n+1).
\end{aligned}$$

Application of the well-known formula $B(x,n+1) = x\binom{x+n}{n}$ for the Beta function shows that identity (1) is valid, for the function f_r. Because both sides are rational functions the restriction $x>0$ can be omitted.

3 The proof by Parker

Melzak presented his identity (1) in the problem section of the American Mathematical Monthly in 1951. We sketch the published solution by Parker [1]. His proof (see [3, p. 98]) used the Lagrange interpolation polynomial. Let

$$\omega_n(x) = \prod_{\nu=0}^{n} (x - x_\nu).$$

The Lagrange interpolation polynomial of degree n with respect to the knots $x_0, x_1, \ldots, x_n$ can be written in the form

$$L_n(x) = \omega_n(x) \sum_{k=0}^{n} \frac{f(x_k)}{(x - x_k)\,\omega_n'(x_k)}. \tag{3}$$

Obviously, we have $\omega_n'(x_k) = \prod_{\nu=0,\nu\neq k}^{n} (x_k - x_\nu)$. We choose $x_k = -k$. Then $\omega_n(x) = x(x+1)\cdots(x+n)$ and $\omega_n'(-k) = \prod_{\nu=0,\nu\neq k}^{n} (-k+\nu) = (-1)^k k!\,(n-k)!$ which leads to

$$L_n(x) = \binom{x+n}{n} \sum_{k=0}^{n} (-1)^k \binom{n}{k} \frac{f(-k)}{x+k}.$$

Let f be a polynomial of degree $\leq n$. Then L_n coincides with f and we obtain Melzak's identity (1), by a shift of the variable replacing $f(.)$ with $f(. + y)$.

4 The generalization of Melzak's identity

Now we turn to formula (2). Let $x_0, x_1, \cdots, x_j$ be pairwise different reals. The Lagrange interpolation polynomial (3) of $f(x) = 1$ with respect to the knots $x_0, \ldots, x_j$ is

$$1 = f(x) = L_j(x) = \omega_j(x) \sum_{i=0}^{j} \frac{1}{(x - x_i) \prod_{\nu=0,\nu\neq i}^{j} (x_i - x_\nu)}.$$

Evaluation at $x = -k$ yields the partial fraction decomposition

$$\frac{1}{\prod_{\nu=0}^{j} (k + x_\nu)} = \sum_{i=0}^{j} \frac{1}{(k + x_i) \prod_{\nu=0,\nu\neq i}^{j} (x_\nu - x_i)}$$

(see [3, Eq. (7.51)]). Following [3, p. 92–93] J. Quaintance and H. W. Gould multiply the latter equation by $(-1)^k \binom{n}{k} f(y-k)$, sum over k, interchange the order of summation on the right side and apply Melzak's identity (1) in order to obtain

$$\sum_{k=0}^{n} (-1)^k \binom{n}{k} \frac{f(y-k)}{\prod_{\nu=0}^{j} (k + x_\nu)} = \sum_{i=0}^{j} \frac{f(x_i + y)}{x_i \binom{x_i+n}{n} \prod_{\nu=0,\nu\neq i}^{j} (x_\nu - x_i)},$$

for all polynomials f of degree $\leq n$ (see [3, Eq. (7.52)]). This is identity (2).

Now we are going to prove this identity to hold even for all polynomials f of degree $\leq n+j$ as it was claimed in [3, Eq. (7.52)]. To this end we choose $f(x) = \binom{-x}{j}$. The Lagrange interpolation polynomial (3) with respect to the knots $x_0, \ldots, x_j$ is

$$\binom{-x}{j} = f(x) = L_j(x) = \omega_j(x) \sum_{i=0}^{j} \frac{1}{(x-x_i)\prod_{\nu=0,\nu\neq i}^{j}(x_i-x_\nu)} \binom{-x_i}{j}.$$

Evaluation at $x = -k$ yields

$$\sum_{i=0}^{j} \frac{1}{(-k-x_i)\prod_{\nu=0,\nu\neq i}^{j}(x_i-x_\nu)} \binom{-x_i}{j} = \frac{1}{\omega_j(-k)} \binom{k}{j}.$$

Using $\binom{-x_i}{j} = (-1)^j \binom{x_i+j-1}{j}$ and $\omega_j(-k) = (-1)^{j+1} \prod_{\nu=0}^{j}(k+x_\nu)$ we conclude that

$$\begin{aligned} &\sum_{k=0}^{n+j} (-1)^k \binom{n+j}{k} \frac{f(y-k)}{\prod_{\nu=0}^{j}(k+x_\nu)} \binom{k}{j} \\ = &\sum_{i=0}^{j} \frac{(-1)^j}{\prod_{\nu=0,\nu\neq i}^{j}(x_i-x_\nu)} \binom{x_i+j-1}{j} \sum_{k=0}^{n+j} (-1)^k \binom{n+j}{k} \frac{f(y-k)}{k+x_i}. \end{aligned}$$

Using $\binom{n+j}{k}\binom{k}{j} = \binom{n+j}{j}\binom{n}{k-j}$ and application of Melzak's identity (1) leads to

$$\binom{n+j}{j} \sum_{k=j}^{n+j} (-1)^k \binom{n}{k-j} \frac{f(y-k)}{\prod_{\nu=0}^{j}(k+x_\nu)} = \sum_{i=0}^{j} \frac{(-1)^j}{\prod_{\nu=0,\nu\neq i}^{j}(x_i-x_\nu)} \binom{x_i+j-1}{j} \frac{f(x+y)}{x_i\binom{x_i+n+j}{n+j}},$$

for all polynomials f of degree $\leq n+j$. Using $\binom{x_i+n+j}{n+j} = \binom{x_i+n+j}{n}\binom{x_i+j}{j}\binom{n+j}{n}^{-1}$ we obtain

$$\sum_{k=0}^{n} (-1)^{k+j} \binom{n}{k} \frac{f(y-k-j)}{\prod_{\nu=0}^{j}(k+j+x_\nu)} = \sum_{i=0}^{j} \frac{1}{\prod_{\nu=0,\nu\neq i}^{j}(x_\nu-x_i)} \binom{x_i+j-1}{j} \frac{f(x_i+y)}{x_i\binom{x_i+n+j}{n}\binom{x_i+j}{j}}.$$

The shifts $y \to y+j$ and $x_\nu \to x_\nu - j$ $(\nu = 0, \ldots, j)$ yield

$$\sum_{k=0}^{n} (-1)^{k+j} \binom{n}{k} \frac{f(y-k)}{\prod_{\nu=0}^{j}(k+x_\nu)} = \sum_{i=0}^{j} \frac{1}{\prod_{\nu=0,\nu\neq i}^{j}(x_\nu-x_i)} \binom{x_i-1}{j} \frac{f(x_i+y)}{(x_i-j)\binom{x_i+n}{n}\binom{x_i}{j}}.$$

Now formula (2) follows, for all polynomials f of degree $\leq n+j$, by the observation that $(x_i-j)\binom{x_i}{j} = x_i\binom{x_i-1}{j}$.

References

[1] Z. A. Melzak, V. D. Gokhale, and W. V. Parker, Advanced Problems and Solutions: Solutions: 4458, *Amer. Math. Monthly* **60** (1953), 53–54.

[2] Z. A. Melzak, Problem 4458, *Amer. Math. Monthly* **58** (1951), 636.

[3] Jocelyn Quaintance and Henry W. Gould, Combinatorial Identities for Stirling Numbers: The Unpublished Notes of H. W. Gould, World Scientific Publishing, Singapore 2016.